



Justice for Victims of Child Sexual Abuse Task Force
September 24th, 2019, 3:00 p.m.
Governor's 2nd Floor Conference Room
1700 W. Washington, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

A general meeting of the Justice for Victims of Child Sexual Abuse Task Force was convened on September 24, 2019 at the Governor's 2nd Floor Conference Room at 1700 W. Washington, Phoenix, Arizona 85007, notice having been duly given.

I. Call to Order

- **Ms. Rachel Mitchell, Co-Chair**, called the Justice for Victims of Child Sexual Abuse Task Force meeting to order at 3:05 p.m. with 20 members and 10 staff and guests present.
- **Ms. Mitchell, Co-Chair**, welcomed everyone and requested a roll call. The following members were present: **Ms. Rachel Mitchell, Co-Chair**, and Chief Deputy, Maricopa County Attorney Office; **The Honorable Paul Boyer, Co-Chair** and Arizona State Senator; **Ms. Tasha Menaker**, Co-Chief Executive Officer, Arizona Coalition to End Sexual and Domestic Violence; **Ms. Jennifer Pinnow**, Major, Arizona Department of Public Safety; **Mr. Keith Moffitt**, Detective, Arizona Department of Child Safety; **The Honorable Victoria Steele**, Arizona State Senator; **The Honorable Sine Kerr**, Arizona State Senator; **The Honorable Heather Carter**, Arizona State Senator; **Ms. Anni Foster**, General Counsel, Office of Governor Doug Ducey; **Ms. Maria Fuentes**, Director, Governor's Office of Youth, Faith and Family; **The Honorable Jennifer Longdon**, Arizona State Representative; **Ms. Meghaen Dell'Artino**, Owner, Public Policy Partners; **Ms. Shawn Cox**, Victim Services Division Chief, Maricopa County Attorney Office; **Mr. Greg Kelly**, Survivor Advocate; **Ms. Dianne Umphress**, Executive Director, Amberly's Place; **The Honorable Regina Cobb**, Arizona State Representative; **Mr. Timothy Chavez**, Chief of Police, Gila River Police Department; and **Ms. Colleen Clase**, Chief Counsel, Arizona Voice for Crime Victims. The following members introduced themselves via telephone: **The Honorable Shawna Bolick**, Arizona State Representative and **Mr. Kevin Treadway**, Chief of Police, Flagstaff Police Department. The following members were excused from the meeting: **Ms. Christina Corieri**, Senior Policy Advisor, Office of Governor Doug Ducey; **Ms. Annette Schuster**, Kids Need to Know, Inc.; and **The Honorable TJ Shope**, Arizona State Representative.

II. Approval of Minutes

- **Sen. Paul Boyer, Co-Chair**, requested a motion to approve the September 5, 2019, meeting minutes.
 - **Sen. Carter** motioned to accept the minutes as drafted.
 - **Rep. Longdon** seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes.

III. Presentation: Human trafficking

- **Mr. Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair of the Arizona Human Trafficking Council and Director of the Arizona Department of Homeland Security** gave a presentation on human trafficking and the work being done by the Council. The Arizona Human Trafficking Council consists of four subcommittees: 1) Outreach and Awareness, 2) Policy, 3) Victim Services, and 4) Training / Data & Research. The Council has provided trainings for 35,000 Arizonans on how to detect and determine whether a child is being trafficked. He noted the importance of replacing the term “child prostitute” with “child sex trafficking victim.” He discussed the issue of “pro-per”, which is when an accused perpetrator represents himself in court and is allowed to cross examine the victim. He also discussed the need for a large focus on prevention and training for educators. Mr. Orrantia then spoke about “The Collaborative”, which is a successful project that incorporates hospitals, law enforcement, the Department of Child Safety, and other health behavioral providers in order to provide services to victims. He then showed a video highlighting the success of The Collaborative: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bbgRpcXpYYc>.
- **Sen. Carter** noted the overlap between the Task Force and the Human Trafficking Council and encouraged collaboration between them. **Ms. Fuentes** highlighted the importance of educating kids and parents on what grooming looks like. She also asked how The Collaborative model could be launched statewide. **Ms. Foster** referenced the discussion of the statute of limitations for sex trafficking, and that it should be a high priority for the task force. **Ms. Dell’Artino** echoed the importance of changing the statute of limitations for sex trafficking and the importance of addressing the issues of cross-examinations because currently the defendant has the right to confront the accuser in court. **Ms. Pinnow** pointed out that victims are usually in need of lifelong services and that requires a larger budget for victim services. **Ms. Umphress** noted that the Governor’s Office on Youth, Faith and Family has MDTs (Multi-Disciplinary Teams) across the state that can spread The Collaborative model and best practices obtained from it.

IV. Presentation: Victim services during the criminal process

- **Ms. Susie Checkett, Assistant Division Chief, Ms. Laura Lopez, Division Trainer, Ms. Cindy Walker, Advocate & K-9 Handler, and Elle the dog from the Victim Services Division at the Maricopa County Attorney’s Office (MCAO)** presented on the purpose/mission of their office and the resources they provide to victims. The services that they provide to victims include: inform and explain victim rights/criminal justice system, provide hearing notifications, act as a liaison between prosecutor and victim, provide court accompaniment, convey plea agreements (probation vs. jail, etc.), provide support/crisis intervention, and trial preparation. Their employees establish trust by developing a rapport with the victim, provide safe places, validate/normalize the victim’s feelings, provide constant communication, and promote self-resilience. This Division has “system-based advocates” and is comprised of 9 specialized bureaus, including the Child Advocacy Bureau. Last year the Victim Services Division served 60,000 victims. The Child Advocacy Bureau deals with child sex crimes and child abuse. It coordinates with the Department of Child Safety and partners with the MDTs around the state. The presenters highlighted the K-9 victim support program by bringing Elle the dog. Elle, along with three other K-9s, offers support to victims by going onto the stand with them during trial, attending meet and greets with the victims and prosecutors, attending sentencings, etc. The use of facility dogs in court proceedings can be references in ARS 13-4442.

- **Ms. Cox** discussed other benefits of the Victim Services Division including coloring books designed for victims, the work done with unsupportive parents, and the funding for the K-9 facility dogs. **Ms. Umphress** asked what the Division does when there is a “bad outcome” in a case. The division advocates stay in contact with the victim post-trial and provides additional resources as needed. **Ms. Dell’Artino** inquired about the post-conviction services for victims. The victims are notified of the release dates of their abusers and are offered community resources. **Ms. Pinnow** confirmed with the Task Force that all counties have advocates, whether they are in-house or outsourced. **Ms. Foster** asked how soon the MCAO comes into contact with the victims after they report to law enforcement. The MCAO contacts the victim once the defendant is arrested; the victim will be contacted within 7 days. **Ms. Pinnow** also pointed out that law enforcement officers are usually uninformed of available resources and need to be trained on how to deal with a child sex trafficking case and where to direct the victim to in order to get resources.

V. Presentation: Examples of successful cold case investigations and prosecutions

- **Mr. Robert Fernow, Detective, Maricopa County Attorney Office** gave an overview of the difficulties that are faced when investigating cold cases. He shared that the biggest challenge is to locate the victim because they are likely to move, and in some cases, they do not want to be found. The other difficulties of investigating cold cases are the reintroduction of trauma for the victims and evidence retention as there can be the purging of evidence facilities due to limited storage. The memory of the victim can also prove to be an issue due to inconsistencies or lack of recollection. The two main reasons why a cold case is revisited are 1) because there was a hit in the CODIS database (Combined DNA Index System), and 2) the offender may present himself/herself in another case. Mr. Fernow also referenced the SAKI (Sexual Assault Kit Initiative) Grant which was given to MCAO to address the backlog of untested kits, and it also funds additional investigators. The three main benefits of the SAKI grant are 1) testing, 2) investigations, and 3) training.
- **Ms. Umphress** asked what the time frame is for a case to become a cold case. The time frame is typically 1 year. **Sen. Steele** asked what the biggest challenges are that Mr. Fernow faces while investigating cold cases. The biggest challenges are understanding the counterintuitive behavior that victims may have, the communication between agencies, and the record management systems in different counties. **Rep. Longdon** asked about the first contact that is made with a victim when a cold case is reopened. Mr. Fernow assured that this is done case-by-case depending on the circumstances and history of the case; either a knock on the door or a phone call with an in-person follow up. **Ms. Dell’Artino** brought up the existence of a “purge of evidence law”. **Ms. Mitchell** confirmed that the law can be found in ARS 13-4221.

VI. Presentation: Potential improvements in criminal law

- **Ms. Mitchell, Co-Chair**, announced that due to time constraints, this presentation will be moved to a later meeting.

VI. Discussion between task force members

- **Sen. Boyer, Co-Chair** opened up the general discussion between task force members. **Ms. Umphress** noted that not all counties have investigators that primarily focus on cold cases, and that Maricopa County is fortunate to have these resources. **Sen. Carter** expressed concern over of the unknown number of cold cases, and the

short time frame it takes for a case to be classified as “cold” (1 year). **Ms. Dell’Artino** stated the importance of a statewide database is to link the names of accused person since there is clearly a lack of DNA evidence in most of these cases. **Mr. Kelly** proposed the idea of appointing one or more speakers from the task force to report to other relevant institutions on the work being done in these meetings and educate them on the new law. **Ms. Foster** cautioned the task force about entering names in databases without any evidence to link the names to the crime. **Ms. Pinnow** suggested that the said database should be established using Federal requirements. **Sen. Boyer** mentioned the need for a database for schools and educational institutions so they are able to see if a potential employer has been accused of assault before. **Ms. Mitchell** discussed the Children’s Justice Project and the coordinator that is currently available to do trainings at schools, churches, and other institutions.

VII. Upcoming Meeting Dates

- **Sen. Boyer, Co-Chair**, announced the following meeting dates for the coming year:
 - Tuesday, October 1, 2019 at 1:00 p.m. at 1700 W. Washington Street, 3rd Floor Conference Room
 - Thursday, October 24, 2019 at 1:00 p.m. at 1700 W. Washington Street, 3rd Floor Conference Room
 - Thursday, November 7, 2019 at 1:00 p.m. at 1700 W. Washington Street, 2nd Floor Conference Room
 - Thursday, November 21, 2019 at 1:00 p.m. at 1700 W. Washington Street, 2nd Floor Conference Room

VIII. Call to the Public

- **Sen. Boyer, Co-Chair**, made a call to the public. No comments from public members were made.

IX. Adjourn

- **Ms. Mitchell, Co-Chair**, called for adjournment at 4:58 p.m.
 - **Ms. Fuentes** motioned to adjourn, **Sen. Steele** seconded the motion, and the task force voted unanimously to adjourn.

Dated September 27, 2019
Justice for Victims of Child Sexual Abuse Task Force
Submitted by Grace Appelbe
Policy Assistant, Office of Governor Doug Ducey